# SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

# 1. <u>INTRODUCTION</u>

# 1.1 Dr. Whitney R. Leeman and Marshall Pet Products, Inc.

This Settlement Agreement is entered into by and between Dr. Whitney R. Leeman ("Leeman") and Marshall Pet Products, Inc. ("Marshall"), with Leeman and Marshall collectively referred to as the "Parties." Leeman is an individual residing in the State of California who asserts that she seeks to promote awareness of exposure to toxic chemicals and improve human health by reducing or eliminating hazardous substances contained in consumer products. Marshall employs ten or more persons and is a person in the course of doing business for purposes of the Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, California Health & Safety Code § 25249.6 et seq. ("Proposition 65").

# 1.2 General Allegations

Leeman alleges that Marshall has manufactured, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in the State of California pet grooming tools with vinyl/PVC grips containing the phthalate chemical di(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate ("DEHP") without the requisite Proposition 65 health hazard warnings. DEHP is listed pursuant to Proposition 65 as a chemical known to cause birth defects and other reproductive harm.

# 1.3 **Product Description**

The products that are covered by this Settlement Agreement are pet grooming tools with vinyl/PVC grips containing DEHP including, but not limited to, the *Marshall Ferret Nail Clippers, Item #FG-131 (#7 66501 00131 0)*, manufactured, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale in California by Marshall, hereinafter referred to as the "Products."

# 1.4 Notice of Violation

On or about May 31, 2013, Leeman served Marshall and various public enforcement agencies with a document entitled "60-Day Notice of Violation" ("Notice")

that provided the recipients with notice of alleged violations of Proposition 65 by Marshall for failing to warn its customers and consumers in California that the Products it sold exposed users to DEHP. To the best of the Parties' knowledge, no public enforcer has commenced and is diligently prosecuting the allegations set forth in the Notice.

## 1.5 No Admission

Marshall denies the material, factual, and legal allegations contained in the Notice and maintains that all of the products that it has sold and distributed in California, including the Products, have been, and are, in compliance with all laws. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as an admission by Marshall of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, nor shall compliance with this Settlement Agreement constitute or be construed as an admission by Marshall of any fact, finding, conclusion, issue of law, or violation of law, such being specifically denied by Marshall. However, this Section shall not diminish or otherwise affect Marshall's obligations, responsibilities, and duties under this Settlement Agreement.

# 1.6 Effective Date

For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, the term "Effective Date" shall mean November 15, 2013.

## 2. INJUNCTIVE RELIEF: REFORMULATION

# 2.1 Reformulation Commitment

As of the Effective Date, Marshall shall only manufacture, distribute and/or import for sale or use in the State of California Products that are "Reformulated Products." For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, "Reformulated Products" shall mean Products which contain less than or equal to 1,000 ppm (0.1%) DEHP in each Accessible Component when analyzed pursuant to EPA testing methodologies 3580A and 8270C. "Accessible Component" shall mean a component of a Product that can be touched by a person during normal, intended and foreseeable use of the Product.

## 3. PENALTIES PURSUANT TO HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(b)

In settlement of all the claims referred to in this Settlement Agreement, Marshall shall pay a total of \$4,500 in civil penalties in accordance with this Section. Each penalty payment will be allocated in accordance with California Health & Safety Code §§ 25249.12(c)(1) & (d), with 75% of the funds remitted to the California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment ("OEHHA") and the remaining 25% of the penalty remitted to Leeman, as follows:

# 3.1 <u>Initial Civil Penalty</u>

Marshall shall pay an initial civil penalty in the amount of \$1,500 on or before the Effective Date. Marshall shall issue two separate checks to: (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$1,125; and (b) "The Chanler Group in Trust for Dr. Whitney R. Leeman" in the amount of \$375. All penalty payments shall be delivered to the addresses listed in Section 3.3 below.

# 3.2 Final Civil Penalty

Marshall shall pay a final civil penalty of \$3,000 on or before December 15, 2013. The final civil penalty shall be waived in its entirety, however, if, no later than December 1, 2013, an officer of Marshall provides Leeman with written certification that, as of the date of such certification and continuing into the future, Marshall has met the reformulation standard specified in Section 2.1 above, such that all Products manufactured, imported, distributed, sold and offered for sale in California by Marshall are Reformulated Products. The certification in lieu of a final civil penalty payment provided by this Section is a material term, and time is of the essence. Marshall shall issue two separate checks for its final civil penalty payments to: (a) "OEHHA" in the amount of \$2,250; and (b) "The Chanler Group in Trust for Dr. Whitney R. Leeman" in the amount of \$750.

## 3.3 Payment Procedures

- **3.3.1 Issuance of Payments.** Payments shall be delivered as follows:
- (a) All payments owed to Leeman, pursuant to Sections 3.1 through 3.2, shall be delivered to the following payment address:

The Chanler Group Attn: Proposition 65 Controller 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710

(b) All payments owed to OEHHA (EIN: 68-0284486), pursuant to Sections 3.1 through 3.2, shall be delivered directly to OEHHA (Memo line "Prop 65 Penalties") at the following addresses:

For United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics
Fiscal Operations Branch Chief
Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment
P.O. Box 4010
Sacramento, CA 95812-4010

For Non-United States Postal Service Delivery:

Mike Gyurics Fiscal Operations Branch Chief Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment 1001 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814

With a copy of the checks payable to OEHHA mailed to The Chanler Group at the address set forth above in 3.3.1(a), as proof of payment to OEHHA.

3.3.2 Issuance of 1099 Forms. After each penalty payment, Marshall shall issue separate 1099 forms for each payment to Leeman, whose address and tax identification number shall be furnished upon request after this Settlement Agreement has been fully executed by the Parties, and OEHHA at the addresses listed in Section 3.3.1(b) above.

# 4. REIMBURSEMENT OF FEES AND COSTS

The Parties acknowledge that Leeman and her counsel offered to resolve this dispute without reaching terms on the amount of fees and costs to be reimbursed to them, thereby leaving this fee issue to be resolved after the material terms of the agreement had been settled. Leeman then expressed a desire to resolve the fee and cost issue shortly after the other settlement terms had been finalized. The Parties then attempted to (and did) reach an accord on the compensation due to Leeman and her counsel under general contract principles and the private attorney general doctrine codified at California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5, for all work performed through the mutual execution of this agreement. Marshall shall pay \$22,000 for fees and costs incurred as a result of investigating, bringing this matter to Marshall's attention, and negotiating a settlement in the public interest. Marshall shall issue a separate 1099 for fees and costs (EIN: 94-3171522), shall make the check payable to "The Chanler Group" and shall deliver payment on or before the Effective Date, to the address listed in Section 3.3.1 above.

## 5. CLAIMS COVERED AND RELEASED

## 5.1 Release

This Settlement Agreement is a full, final and binding resolution between Leeman and Marshall, of any violation of Proposition 65 that was or could have been asserted by Leeman on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, against Marshall, its parents, subsidiaries, affiliated entities that are under common ownership, directors, officers, employees, attorneys, and each entity to whom Marshall directly or indirectly distributes or sells Products, including but not limited to downstream distributors, wholesalers, customers, retailers, franchisees, cooperative members, licensors, and licensees ("Releasees"), based on their failure to warn about alleged exposures to DEHP contained in the Products that were manufactured, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Marshall in California before the Effective Date.

In further consideration of the promises and agreements herein contained, Leeman on behalf of herself, her past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives all her rights to institute or participate in, directly or indirectly, any form of legal action and releases all claims that she may have, including, without limitation, all actions, and causes of action, in law or in equity, suits, liabilities, demands, obligations, damages, costs, fines, penalties, losses, or expenses -- including, but not limited to, investigation fees, expert fees, and attorneys' fees, but exclusive of fees and costs on appeal -- limited to and arising under Proposition 65 with respect to DEHP in the Products manufactured, distributed, sold and/or offered for sale by Marshall before the Effective Date (collectively "claims"), against Marshall and Releasees.

## 5.2 Marshall's Release of Leeman

Marshall on behalf of itself, its past and current agents, representatives, attorneys, successors, and/or assignees, hereby waives any and all claims against Leeman, her attorneys and other representatives, for any and all actions taken or statements made (or those that could have been taken or made) by Leeman and her attorneys and other representatives, whether in the course of investigating claims or otherwise seeking to enforce Proposition 65 against it in this matter with respect to the Products.

#### 6. POST EXECUTION ACTIVITIES

Within twelve months of the execution of this Settlement Agreement Marshall may ask Leeman, in writing, to file a complaint, incorporate the terms of this Settlement Agreement into a proposed consent judgment and seek the court's approval of the consent judgment pursuant to California Health and Safety Code § 25249.7, or as may be otherwise allowed by law. If requested, Leeman agrees to reasonably cooperate with Marshall and to use best efforts and that of her counsel to support the entry of a consent judgment incorporating the terms of this Settlement Agreement for approval by a superior court in California. Pursuant to CCP §§ 1021 and 1021.5, Marshall will reimburse

Leeman and her counsel for their reasonable fees and costs incurred in filing the complaint, converting the Settlement Agreement into a proposed consent judgment and seeking judicial approval of the consent judgment in an amount not to exceed \$16,000, exclusive of fees and cost that may be incurred on appeal. Marshall will remit payment to The Chanler Group, at the address set forth in Section 3.3.1 above. Such additional fees shall be paid by Marshall within ten days after its receipt of monthly invoices from Leeman for work performed under this paragraph.

# 7. <u>SEVERABILITY</u>

If, subsequent to the execution of this Settlement Agreement, any of the provisions of this Settlement Agreement are deemed by a court to be unenforceable, the validity of the enforceable provisions remaining shall not be adversely affected.

## 8. GOVERNING LAW

The terms of this Settlement Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and apply within the State of California. In the event that Proposition 65 is repealed or is otherwise rendered inapplicable by reason of law generally, or as to the Products, then Marshall may provide written notice to Leeman of any asserted change in the law, and shall have no further obligations pursuant to this Settlement Agreement with respect to, and to the extent that, the Products are so affected.

#### 9. NOTICES

Unless specified herein, all correspondence and notices required to be provided pursuant to this Settlement Agreement shall be in writing and personally delivered or sent by: (a) first-class, registered or certified mail, return receipt requested; or (b) overnight courier on any party by the other party at the following addresses:

To Marshall:

To Leeman:

Gary Marshall, President Marshall Pet Products, Inc. 5740 Limekiln Road Wolcott, NY 14590

Proposition 65 Coordinator The Chanler Group 2560 Ninth Street Parker Plaza, Suite 214 Berkeley, CA 94710-2565

## With Copy to:

Don Fox Esq.
Eyans & Fox LLP
95 Allens Creek Road Suite 300
Rochester, NY 14618

Any party, from time to time, may specify in writing to the other party a change of address to which all notices and other communications shall be sent.

# 10. COUNTERPARTS: FACSIMILE SIGNATURES

This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts and by facsimile or portable document format (".pdf") signature, each of which shall be deemed an original, and all of which, when taken together, shall constitute one and the same document. A facsimile or .pdf signature shall be as valid as the original.

## 11. COMPLIANCE WITH HEALTH & SAFETY CODE § 25249.7(f)

Leeman and her attorneys agree to comply with the reporting form requirements referenced in California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(f).

#### 12. MODIFICATION

This Settlement Agreement may be modified only by written agreement of the Parties.

#### 13. <u>AUTHORIZATION</u>

The undersigned are authorized to execute this Settlement Agreement on behalf of their respective Parties and have read, understood, and agree to all of the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

AGREED TO: AGREED TO:

By: Whitney R Thomas By: The Hold President

Date:

tney R. Iseeman Peter Reid, President Marshall Pet Products, Inc.